

Parking Management Manual SAC

Monday, September 18, 2017

4 p.m. – 6 p.m.

Portland Building

1120 SW 5th Ave, Suite 800

Portland, OR 97204

Meeting Notes

Members in Attendance

Reza Farhoodi (Pearl District N.A.), Lisa Frisch (Portland Business Alliance), Heather Hoell (Venture Portland), Tony Jordan (Portlanders for Parking Reform), Juliana Lukasik (CEIC), Owen Ronchelli (Go Lloyd), Felicia Williams (DNA)

Project Team in Attendance

PBOT: Chris Armes, Malisa McCreedy, Nicole Powell, Mauricio Leclerc; Kimley-Horn: William Reynolds, Dennis Burns; Spencer: Joseph Spencer

Additional Attendees

Peter Stark (CEIC)

Public Comment Period

- No public comment.

Workshop Outline

- Revisit changes to meter rate adjustment documents based on feedback.
- Discuss event districts and time limits.
- Project Schedule
 - 5/15: Manual Intro, 6/19-7/17: Meter Districts/Revenue Allocation, 7/17-9/18: Price/Time Limits, 9/18-10/16: Time Limits/Event Districts, 10/16: Loading Zones/Enforcement, 11/27 Draft Manual
 - At the November meeting, we will go through the full draft manual, it will largely consist of documents we've seen. The documents will be distributed for review before the meeting for review.
- Logistics: There are two topic focus areas for the meeting: event districts and time limits. Use name card to request floor, need to hear from everyone. Reminder to stay focused due to limited time.

SAC #3 Recap

1. Documents were updated based on discussion from the last meeting.
 - Updated language to emphasize that a performance-based pricing approach will allow customers to more easily find parking, supporting economic vitality.
 - Added additional background on NW, CEID, Lloyd, and Marquam Hill meter districts.

- Added citation rates as performance measure.
 - Heather – Need clarification on citation vs. violation.
 - William – Violations are observed in the field and citations are issued by parking enforcement.
 - Heather – Will there be a metric related to citation rate if areas are under performing and then an associated staffing shift?
 - William – It is an indicator that there might be a need for increased enforcement.
 - Joe – You want to assess enforcement by looking at violation rate and capture rate. Capture rate is the percentage that are in violation and cited. If the reality is you can violate and won't be cited, people will ignore time limits. You want to see about a 10-20% capture rate to get the point across to people to follow the parking rules.
 - Heather – Increasing the meter rate is meant to manage demand.
 - Dennis – If capture rate data is low, then you want to look at that before adjusting the price.
 - Juliana – What is happening with parking enforcement?
 - Heather - If citation rates are low, you would want to increase enforcement resources before a rate increase.
 - William – We didn't have a trigger for violation, so we can revisit thresholds in the enforcement discussion.
- Target occupancy changed to 65-85%.
- Added language to clarify that performance-based process will inform and SAC will recommend rate adjustments.
 - Felicia – Will an SAC convene with every rate adjustment?
 - William – Adjustments will be made no more than once a year, a report will be generated and the SAC will have a 90-day period to convene (if a SAC exists).
 - Juliana – That is how CEID works now.
 - Felicia – Can we list SAC/TMA in the document?
 - Yes.
 - Tony – Assuming the initial rate downtown is \$2/hr, a year goes by and data is looked at, an adjustment up to \$0.60 is proposed (plus more time for SAC review) and another year goes by and the rate is adjusted again – it seems too timid. Is there any way to calibrate districts better to jump start the process or to start from a different base? To meet goals of the project we shouldn't wait so long to get to the occupancy goal.

- Malisa – This is a starting point, there is a political piece to it, we can talk about this more if it is not ambitious enough.
- Felicia – Downtown, Old Town, and some other districts don't have a SAC or a say.
- Tony – The process has taken a long time, are there other ways to adjust rates? To determine what the initial price should be?
- Dennis – The concept of LA Express Park was real time occupancy and demand changes, but you can't change the rules so much that people don't know the rules or how to behave. You could have a special recommendation for Council to be more aggressive with adjusting rates.
- Tony – What if a SAC wants a higher rate, would that be possible?
 - Malisa – We could add language based on data, but we don't want to make rates so high that it deters people from coming downtown.
 - Lisa – We must give time for the market to adjust, we are currently in good economic times, but the market can fall and change demand.
- Tony – Not suggesting changing the tiered approach, but people complain when the price increases and they don't see a change (still can't find parking).
 - Lisa – Does the data show that?
 - Malisa – Can start with a \$0.60 adjustment and see what happens, initially some won't park on the street, but number of people parking will increase again.

Focus Area #1: Event Districts

- Lisa – Can you define an event district and what an event is? Is it just sporting events? There are concerts in the parks and lots of other types of large events.
 - William – Our focus is the venue, currently Providence Park and outreach to the Convention Center and Rose Quarter have taken place, they might be interested.
 - Lisa – We see these areas are clear districts.
 - Felicia – How event districts are created matters, want clarification.

1. Background and Goals

- What are the issues? No standard process for meter rates and hours in event districts. Rates set by City Council, no formal on-street rate policy.
- Committee's charge is to inform process for increased rates during events and provide guidance for data collection requirements and periodic review.
- Why implement increase event district rates? To incentivize the use of alternative modes, plus the lower on-street rates compared to off-street rates can lead to more circulation as

drivers look for lower cost parking. Example: at the Rose Quarter, you can park on street for \$1/hr vs. \$26 for an off-street garage.

- Dennis – What about time limits?
 - William – Time limits are set through a different process to determine if on street is appropriate event parking.
- Heather – Why shouldn't event attendees be allowed to park on street? Businesses near Providence Park need parking.
 - Malisa – The goal is to manage event traffic, people can get to businesses and push some of the event traffic to off street parking. Providence Park worked with the neighborhood for an agreement.
- Heather – The previous slide showing event parking vs. restricted event parking, how was the restricted area determined?
 - Chris – The restricted areas (shown in yellow) is part of the NW parking plan.
 - William – Is the goal to maintain turnover (restricted event parking) or is it alright for longer term parking (event parking).
- Felicia – The map isn't accurate; the event parking area should extend further west. Can someone use Parking Kitty to extend their time?
 - Chris – They would have to repark to follow the rules. We will revisit the map and adjust as needed.
- Pia – Does event parking support going to an event? Other cities support going to events by having more/special bus service.
 - Lisa – MAX isn't stacked up waiting after events, if transit isn't good people won't take it.
 - Heather – Took transit to the Blues Fest, it was crowded and had to wait a long time after the festival for a bus home.
 - Lisa – MAX has staging lines near Providence Park, but they are not used.
 - Pia – We can ask TriMet about additional service.
 - Reza – Who pays for the extra service? In other cities, the teams pay for it.
 - Lisa – There should be scheduled service to meet the demand.
 - Joe – Transit riders and monthly/annual pass holders pay a standard rate, if TriMet builds in extra service there is an additional cost for that service.
 - Pia – Is an alternative not feasible?
 - Joe – It is complex.

- Mauricio – This is a huge topic, it is a complex system, we will take this back to TriMet.
- Juliana – The system works well (as a Timber’s season ticket holder) and raising event rates is a bad idea. Lots of people drive due to the reasons just discussed, in the short term you discourage parking, you will create more circulation looking for lower cost parking vs. leaving the system alone. The cost of parking is already high, so people feel the pinch, alternatives are not feasible for all.
 - Chris – The goal is to develop guidance for having an event district, like Go Lloyd working to create an event district near the Convention Center and Rose Quarter.
 - Juliana – I think it is a great idea for the Rose Quarter, the high rate pushes some people to use alternative modes.
 - William – The rate is set at a point so it achieves some open spots.
 - Juliana – At Providence Park the parking and bike racks are full and the neighbors seem happy.
 - Chris – When Providence Park adds 4000 seats, they will need to look for more options, we need the ability to have that conversation.
 - Juliana – At some playoff games you didn’t have to pay the event district rate, the system is behind. Can the system capture playoffs and schedule changes?
 - Chris – There are limitations with the meter programming.
- Felicia – Does the 10th & Yamhill SmartPark have event pricing? (No one in the room knows)
- Juliana – The Timbers engage ticket holders in alternative modes of transportation.
- Heather – There is a need for more overt language about alternative transportation options. The Rose Quarter and Convention Center could consider an attendance threshold that warrants the discussion around what events have the higher on street parking rate. Don’t have event or event district definition.
 - William – They adjust off-street rate based on attendance.
- Dennis – Are there multiple events that create conflict? The Dallas Arts District has 48 event venues – picture a matrix with the number of events per day and level 1, 2, 3, 4 on what transportation options are needed to accommodate that based on the number of events happening.
 - Malisa – We only have the Rose Quarter and Convention Center cluster, so the Dallas example doesn’t fit what we are considering.
- Felicia – TriMet is responsible for additional service.

- Malisa – SmartPark has special offers during the holidays and some other festivals.
 - Heather – Does the City control SmartPark?
 - Malisa – SmartPark garages are owned by PBOT. We can drive traffic into SmartPark.
 - Felicia – Is there event pricing for Timbers at SmartPark?
 - Malisa – Timbers partner with season ticket holders for SmartPark.
- Key Metrics: occupancy, violation rates, citation rates, and off-street rates.
- Currently hourly rates: \$2 in Downtown (\$3.50 Providence park event rate), \$1.60 in NW and Marquam Hill, \$1.20 in CEID, and \$1 in Lloyd.
- If a family of 4 parks 4 hours for an event in the Rose Quarter costs are as follows: \$26 for off-street event parking, \$20 for transit or BIKETOWN, and \$4 for on-street parking.
 - Lisa – BIKETOWN is not a viable option for a family of four because you must be 18 or older to use BIKETOWN.

2. Draft Event District Guidance

- Event District boundaries established based on a targeted outreach effort.
- Set initial Event District rate to at least 200% of the standard meter rate, subject to: minimum initial rate of \$3 and maximum initial rate of \$10.
- Target occupancy of 65-85%, rate adjustment of +/- \$1 or \$2 or \$3, hourly rate change of \$3 to \$10/hr, and data collected every 12 months.
 - Heather – Is there a best practice around where the 200% came from?
 - William – No, the percentage is based on what is done at Providence Park.
 - Heather- Why not 200% to 300% vs. increasing by \$1, \$2, or \$3 after the initial percentage?
 - William – This was discussed a lot. Competing with high off-street rates, need to be able to communicate the rates and having \$4.20 or \$4.60 vs. even dollar rates, the even dollar rates are more clear to communicate.
 - Felicia – Is the goal to drive people to park in SmartPark garages?
 - Chris – Wouldn't be driving people to SmartPark. Currently SmartPark garages are downtown only.
 - Felicia – There are private owned and City owned garages on the east side.
 - Juliana – The Lloyd district and Providence Park are very different. There are few off-street options near Providence Park. The goal is to fill parking at high rates and

that alternatives are used. Is there anything to consider at the Rose Quarter, want to have a conversation with them and don't want to pull people from Rose Quarter garages to on street.

- Chris – We have met with representatives from the Rose Quarter.
- Malisa – The Rose Quarter is supportive. These are just guidelines to allow us to do this, would do more outreach, this part of the manual gives us the framework.
- Juliana – Need to consider equity, want to be family friendly.
 - Malisa – The on-street rates are still less expensive than transit or a private garage. The goal is to cut down on congestion and make the modes more equally attractive.
- Joe – Time limits are preventative for some events; some people go into the residential neighborhood areas to find parking.
- Lisa – The City owns parking garages at the Rose Quarter, want to see data on usage.
 - Malisa – The garages are well used. The City owns, but doesn't operate the garages.
 - Lisa – We should have transparency.
 - Malisa – PBOT is not able to get the data, we need a request.
 - Juliana - The PMM SAC requests the data on parking usage in the City owned garages.
 - PBOT staff will follow-up on this request.
- Reza – has there been outreach in the Elliot neighborhood?
 - Malisa – We haven't done any outreach there.
 - Owen – Go Lloyd has spoken with representatives from the Elliot neighborhood, they are interested, but want to know how changes could impact parking near their houses. Discussions broke down, but were primarily focused around event days.
- Reviewed the recommended rate change guidance graphic, where a \$3 increase is made in high occupancy areas to reduce occupancy rates closer to the goal range. It is important to consider what blocks serve the events when adjusting rates.
 - Felicia – If you parked 3 hours at the \$10/hr rate, that would be \$30 to park, which is the absolute peak, when it is about \$26 to park in a garage at the Rose Quarter.
 - William – These are recommended rate changes; the rate doesn't have to go that high.
 - Tony – Where does the money go? To additional bus services? The general fund?

- Chris – The additional money goes into the general transportation revenue (GTR).
 - Tony – Could it go to TDM? (multiple comments from SAC member echoing/supporting this)
- Juliana – Why would we raise the rate if the area is 100% occupied?
 - Owen – Based on the 85% occupancy rule.
 - Juliana – So if the occupancy rate is 100%, the goal is to get back to 85%?
 - Owen – Yes, want 15% availability to support businesses in the area without going to the game.
- Heather – Is there a difference in expected parking time at Providence Park vs. the Rose Quarter.
 - Reza – Soccer games are about 2 hours and basketball games are closer to 2.5-3 hours.
- Heather – Could there be a different rate schedule based on the length of time? A different maximum rate for a shorter event vs. a longer event.
 - Chris – Want to go back to the data for the right price.
 - Owen – It is less based on the cost of a trip, than the demand for parking. There is variation for time spent at an event depending on the type of event.
 - Chris – The hours the meters are functioning would be different in different areas, would work with the event districts on establishing rate and meter hours.
 - Heather – Do they have the same rate? Or a different threshold?
 - Chris – The data will tell us, Providence Park and the Rose Quarter can have different rates.
- Felicia – Where does the money go?
 - Heather – Can we add language to the manual that the money should help fund services in the district? (support from SAC members for having money go back into the districts)
- Dennis – Should we consider time levels and levels of enforcement?
 - Malisa – We have an agreement with Providence Park on those. What we need to do is establish the framework to form the event districts. The specifics would be worked out with the district with outreach efforts beyond this. We acknowledge there is an issue and districts would be formed with the community.
- Pia – What would prevent us from putting this in the manual?

- Malisa – Part of the challenge is that events happen at different times of the day on different days. Need to have individual conversations with the community and not overengineer now.
- William – We’ve received lots of feedback, but we are pressed on time and need to move to the next topic.

Focus Area #2: Time Limits

1. Background

- What are the issues? No standard guidance for high-turnover spaces (15/30 min) or 4-hour zones. No review process to confirm ongoing need.
- Committee’s charge is to inform process for reviewing and granting time stay modifications requests and provide guidance for minimum requirements, data collection process, and periodic review.
- We are discussing time limits citywide, not just the meter districts.
- We pulled criteria for high-turnover spaces from the NW District and CEID Parking Management Plans, there are 8 key items to consider.
 - High-turnover spaces are 15 or 30 minute stalls.
 - High-turnover exception spaces will be located at the ends of blocks (next to intersections) to simplify signage and provide easy access.
 - It is important to limit the number of exceptions and a high variety of stall types is not encouraged.
 - High-turnover exception spaces will be used for specific types of business, the businesses must document a high percentage of short transactions.
 - High-turnover spaces are not for businesses with available off-street parking.
 - Data shows occupancy on block faces adjacent to a business exceeding 85% during peak hours will justify a reduced base time standard.
 - Citation data for existing high turnover exception spaces indicate there are used for short stays.
 - The inventory of exception spaces and adjacent businesses will be surveyed every two years to determine if conditions supporting their use have changed.

2. Draft Time Limits Guidance

- General Citywide time limit guidance: 1. 2-hour time limits will serve as the default when time limits are implemented. 2. High-turnover stalls (15/30 minutes) will be implemented based on requests from individual businesses, subject to certain requirements. 3. 4-hour zones will be implemented at the request of the host Parking Management District or Meter District, subject to certain requirements.

- Pia – Why? There is 2-hour parking by the Armory. Why can't a business request 4-hour time limits?
 - Reza – The 2-hour meters are only during the day, not in the evening when there are likely events at the Armory.
 - Malisa – The time limits are based on land use and enforcement capabilities.

3. Draft High-Turnover Space Guidance

- General Citywide Guidelines: A. High turnover stalls (15 or 30 min) will be located adjacent to intersections. B. No more than four high turnover stalls will be installed per block. C. At least once every two years, the inventory of high-turnover spaces will be updated to determine if conditions supporting their use have changed.
- Minimum requirements (for businesses making request): 1. On-street parking on the block is managed with either time limits or meters. 2. The requesting business is recognized as a qualified high turnover business type or can demonstrate an average stay duration of 15 minutes or less. 3. The requesting business does not have private off-street parking available for customers. 4. On-street parking occupancy on the adjacent block exceeds 85% during at least two hours during the most recent round of data collection (PBOT to collect data if not available).
- Qualified high turnover business types: coffee shops, dry cleaners, day cares, banks, and post offices.
 - Reza – I don't see language around bus stops, there are still bus zones with parking next to them where the bus doesn't pull up to the curb.
 - Malisa – This should be part of our bus zone language we can do a review of those stops.
 - Reza – It should be a requirement to have the high turnover spaces not in a bus zone.
 - Malisa – This is something else to clean up, please send me more information about the locations you know about.
 - Heather – If an individual business makes the request, how do they get the data? Do they have to prove the criteria?
 - Malisa – The business makes the request, but PBOT would do the data collection. We currently handle requests on demand. The list of example businesses includes the type of businesses that would make these requests and we would grant them to.
 - Heather – What is the business responsible for and what does PBOT do?
 - Malisa – We will clarify that. That business makes request and PBOT collects data to see if criteria is met.
 - Heather – What is expected turnaround time?

- Malisa – It is based on workload, but once request is made, it usually takes about a week to complete.
- Juliana – Supportive of a 2-year review. Would like to add a step to confirm that the business still wants the stall at the 2-year review. Concerned about the list of business types, other businesses might qualify.
 - Malisa – We can change language to high turnover business examples.
 - William – Other businesses can demonstrate that they qualify and the list of business types can be used as examples of business types.
- Felicia – Will 15/30 min stalls be moved to corners?
 - Malisa – That is the goal, so special uses are consistent.
- Felicia – Will all others be 2 or 4 hours?
 - Malisa – Yes, we are trying to change the time stays so all are 2hrs, 4hrs, 15 min, or 30 min. We want the block faces to mirror each other and to be more consistent.
- Heather – Can businesses band together to make a request and ask for two stalls on the same block? Can they apply together?
 - Malisa – Yes.

4. Draft 4-Hour Zone Guidance

- General citywide guidance: A. 4-hour time zones may be used in these areas to provide additional parking options when the off-street system does not adequately serve the needs of visitors who plan to stay in the area for two to four hours. B. At least once every two years, the inventory of four-hour zones will be updated to determine if conditions supporting their use have changed. If land uses have changed, the four-hour zone may be removed.
- Minimum requirements: 1. The proposed four-hour zone includes at least 40 on-street parking stalls on contiguous blocks for conversion from two-hour parking to four-hour parking. 2. There are no public off-street parking facilities within 1000 feet of the proposed 4-hour zone, or the average occupancy reaches or exceeds 85% during 3 or more hours during the day in all off-street public parking areas within 1000 feet of the proposed 4-hour zone. 3. There are multiple identified destinations within the proposed 4-hour zone where the average visitor stay duration is between 2 and 4 hours. 4. The average parking duration on each block proposed for conversion is 2 hours or longer.
 - Heather – Can 4 hour zones be requested by businesses, not just an SAC? It would be helpful to add some land use examples/business types for 4 hour zones (like movie theaters, restaurants, etc.).
 - Malisa – If businesses make the request there would still have to meet the first criteria (blocks).

- Heather – What about off-street parking within 1000 feet that is not available, like a bank after hours.
 - The off-street parking must be available to the public, so the bank within 1000 feet of the 4-hour zone would not impact the zone.
- Felicia – Has code been changed to allow multiple types of uses in garages?
 - Mauricio – Multiple uses are allowed in some garages, but it will be a few more months until Council votes (probably in January) on these code changes. It is a complicated topic, but in some cases multiple uses are allowed.
- Felicia – The Ladd Tower garage near the Park Blocks is half private and half public, could a 4-hour zone still be in play in that area?
 - Malisa – Would have to look at all the criteria to see if it meets the requirements.
 - A public garage means that the public can park there.
- Juliana – Concerned about 1000 feet distance, how did you come up with that? Was there a City survey? Would that be considered a deal breaker or can it be considered on a case by case basis?
 - Malisa – These are guidelines, the concern is that if off street parking is available and more expensive, that is the reason for people wanting less expensive 4-hour on street parking.
- Juliana/Peter – Would it be possible to have 4-hour meters in the Zone G/N buffer area?
 - Chris – The buffer is a unique situation and changes to the buffer are outside of these guidelines, goes back to the CEID parking plan.
- Juliana – Can a request for a 4-hour zone from a business go to the City without a SAC? Where does prepay fall into this?
 - Malisa – Prepay begins 2 hours before time starts, this is specific to the neighborhood agreement. Outreach would take place with the group and discuss prepay then.
- Mauricio – Some blocks can fit 10 vehicles, but 5 is the average (due to driveways, etc.).

Wrap-Up

- At the next meeting, we will discuss changes based on feedback from this meeting, loading zones, and enforcement.

Meeting adjourned.